ACTA Acta Sci. Pol., Administratio Locorum 21(4) 2022, 489–512. https://czasopisma.uwm.edu.pl/index.php/aspal plISSN 1644-0749 eISSN 2450-0771 DOI: 10.31648/aspal.7623

ORIGINAL PAPER Received: 09.03.2022

Accepted: 04.06.2022

# THE DEGREE OF GREENERY IN LODZ CITY, POLAND – CLEARING UP DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN OFFICIAL STATISTICS AND SATELLITE DATA

Adam Bielecki<sup>1⊠</sup>, Krzysztof Będkowski<sup>2⊠</sup>

 <sup>1</sup> ORCID: 0000-0003-1460-2961
 <sup>2</sup> ORCID: 0000-0001-7945-343X
 <sup>1, 2</sup> University of Lodz Kopcińskiego Street 31, 90-142 Łódź, **Poland**

#### ABSTRACT

**Motives:** According to public statistics guidelines, areas officially classified in Lodz city as urban greenery include only forests, parks, lawns, squares and cemeteries. Areas of so-called unsealed greenery are omitted, which, however, have a great positive impact on improving the living conditions of the population. By taking information from satellite images and comparing them with official data, we have received a closer to the reality picture of the city, which is much more better than it would appear from official statistical data. Another dimension which the study addresses is the uneven distribution of greenery of a certain quality in individual units of the city.

Aim: Comparing these data with the fact that the distribution of places of residence is also uneven, an attempt was made to assess the accessibility of green areas for the inhabitants of Lodz city. **Results:** There are much more green spaces, similar in terms of vegetation abundance to the official green spaces. That means the city is underestimated when talking about the degree of greenery.

Keywords: NDVI; urban greenery; Landsat; urban development

## INTRODUCTION

Greenery is an important component of urban space, as it performs a number of very important functions, such as protection against air pollution, maintaining air humidity, mitigating extreme temperatures, reducing noise, while also producing a positive aesthetic impression (Białobok, 1976; Haber & Urbański, 2005; Łukasiewicz A. & Łukasiewicz S., 2016). Green areas also increase the level of satisfaction from living in their vicinity (Wu et al., 2019). Unfortunately, however, there is less and less high-quality greenery in urban areas (DeFries et al., 2010; Konijnendijk, 2003). Nowadays, despite the fact of increasing prices for the space in cities, local governments are more aware of the need for ensuring adequate open space for public use (Sustainable Development Goals). Those areas should be covered by the greenery.

According to currently binding legal acts in Poland, urban green areas are areas within the boundaries of arranged green space performing public functions, such as parks, lawns, promenades, boulevards, botanical gardens, zoos, playgrounds and historic gardens, cemeteries, greenery accompanying roads



<sup>©</sup> Copyright by Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warmińsko-Mazurskiego w Olsztynie

in developed areas, squares, historic fortifications, buildings, landfills, airports, railway stations and industrial facilities (Act, 2004). Such areas are included in official statistics, with the surface area being the main measure of the amount of green resources in a city. In practice, however, it appears that the adopted method of determining the degree of greenery in cities does not fully reflect the actual state of affairs, as there are many green objects in the urban fabric that are not taken into account, and yet perform a number of important functions related to greenery. This is the greenery found in developed plots, industrial and post-industrial areas (Cudny, 2011), along roads and watercourses, and others. What is more - the official data takes different aspect when it came to the classification (e.g function, majority land cover).

The aim of our study is to assess the size of greenery resources (in terms of surface area and quality) in the area of Lodz city (Łódź in Polish, the capital of province and also the 3rd largest city in terms of number of inhabitants in Poland) using publicly available satellite data from the Landsat 8 mission and the NDVI index derived from it, and to compare them with official urban greenery statistics. Based on the NDVI distributions, characteristic boundaries of the range of values for this index were calculated for areas considered as parks, lawns, forests etc. In this way, the different functional areas of the city have been characterised in terms of their greenery and population density. These areas were compared with the whole city, and then the differences between the individual types of areas were presented.

# LITERATURE REVIEW

In many scientific works, the NDVI, Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (Deering, 1978; Jackson & Huete, 1991) was used as a measure of the degree of vegetation development in the studied areas. An important feature of the NDVI is its relationship with both the quantity and quality of greenery in a given area (Jarocińska & Zagajewski, 2008; Jarocińska, 2011). If the pixel of an image consists of objects of different reflectance (e.g. buildings, roadway with asphalt or concrete surface, tree crowns, gardens and lawns), then the NDVI is the resultant of the NDVI coefficients of the individual features, weighted by their share in the pixel area (Wirth et al., 1987). To some extent, the NDVI also reacts to the vertical structure of plant complexes - it is higher in areas with extensive, multi-storey vegetation (Krukowski, 2018). The NDVI can be used in analysing both aerial and satellite images, in assessing the amount of plant biomass at different spatial scales, from individual arable fields to global vegetation zones (Tucker, 1979; Wang et al., 2011), recognition of vegetation (Wang et al., 2009) and its condition (Lhermitte et al., 2010; Kopańczyk & Fitrzyk, 2016), crop maturity analysis (Jackson & Huete, 1991; Panda et al., 2010), the LAI - Leaf Area Index (Colombo et al., 2003), the amount of radiation absorbed by plants through photosynthesis (Badgley et al., 2017), biomass, phenological studies (Lüdecke et al., 1996; Zarzecki & Pasierbiński, 2009; Yan et al., 2018), water stress (Niedzielko et al., 2012), and many others. Nouri et al. (2014) used high resolution satellite images from WorldView-2 mission to determine the relationship of the intensity of field evaporation (evapotranspiration) between areas classified as urban green areas and green areas designated on the basis of the NDVI index, consequently determining the level of water stress for classified green areas and those designated on the basis of satellite images. The NDVI allows to differentiate land cover within agglomerations, which could often be considered (in other studies) as homogeneous, such as meadows (Kosiński et al., 2008; 2012; Kosiński & Kozłowska, 2003), which indicates high sensitivity of the index to plant cover diversity. These results are to some extent linked to the observation that the variability of the NDVI in an area covered by natural vegetation shows a greater correlation with climatic conditions than in areas of intensive human use (Musiał, 2009). The above-mentioned features of NDVI mean that it is often used in urban space studies (Gupta et al., 2012).

Different authors define the NDVI limits in different ways in order to distinguish vegetationcovered areas from others located in Poland. Kubalska

and Preuss (2014) used digital aerial photographs (with 10 cm spatial resolution) and aerial laser scanning data (density 15 points m<sup>-2</sup>) to take stock of green areas in Wrocław city, Poland. They adopted a minimum value of NDVI≥0.1 calculated from the pixels of an orthophotomap made with the use of an infrared channel (the so-called CIR - Color InfraRed). Krukowski et al. (2016) and Krukowski (2018) used IKONOS 2 images and decided to separate two classes of urban greenery: high and low. The first step was to adopt the NDVI>0.2 threshold to separate the vegetation, then the training fields for the two previously mentioned classes were determined and a supervised classification of green areas was performed. They observed higher values of the index for high vegetation, therefore they corrected the threshold discriminating this vegetation to the value of NDVI=0.35. Będkowski and Bielecki (2017) evaluated the availability of greenery based on the NDVI calculated from the Landsat 8 image. A large part of the city was characterised by index values between 0.2-0.3. It has been found that these are areas of the city where development is accompanied by well-developed greenery. Worm et al. (2019) adopted a low NDVI threshold of 0.1 for the purpose of distinguishing plant cover in the city of Lodz on the basis of a CIR aerial orthophotomap. The same boundaries in the study of urban vegetation in the Ursynów district of Warsaw were adopted by Pyra and Adamczyk (2018). For the purposes of analysing vegetation, understood as an element of the Green and Blue Infrastructure, Pluto-Kossakowska et al. (2018) assumed that the optimum range of NDVI values is <0.2, 1> when using an aerial CIR orthophotomap, and <0.5, 1> for Sentinel-2 images. Michałowska and Hejmanowska (2008), on the other hand, calculated the NDVI differences between 1979 (Landsat MSS) and 2000 (Landsat +ETM) to show changes in plant cover in the area of the Słowiński National Park, and concluded that the value in the range of -0.41 to +0.41 means areas with minor changes. Tomaszewski et al. (2011) assumed that MODIS pixels with an NDVI value lower than 0.3 represent areas without vegetation, while those with a value above

0.7 represent areas with intensive vegetation. Values in the range  $0.3 < NDVI \le 0.7$  are related to partial plant cover.

NDVI values are generally calculated with precision to two decimal places – e.g. Walker et al. (2012) in their study if green cover in North American and Eurasian Arctic transects, Robinson et al. 2017 in their study of the variability of NDVI values over 30 years based on image data from three different Landsat missions (5, 7 and 8).

The experience of many authors shows that it is not possible to indicate unambiguously how to interpret a given NDVI level, or with which forms of land cover it can be associated. It is necessary to check the applicable threshold values experimentally each time, in order to distinguish between plant cover and other forms, and to demonstrate the diversity within the vegetation.

In addition the NDVI indicator can be used as one of the image channels along with selected other images, e.g. for classification purposes (Pyra & Adamczyk, 2018). Supervised and unsupervised classification based on pixels in Pléiades images were tested by Trisakti (2017), who achieved high accuracy using a combination of the NDVI vegetation index and blue channel, while Sulma et al. (2016), based on NDVI spectral indices, NDWI (Normalized Difference Water Index) and MSAVI (Modified Soil Adjusted Vegetation Index), distinguished vegetation covered areas from other urban areas of Jakarta (Indonesia) with an overall accuracy of 86%.

NDVI can be calculated on the basis of image data from many satellite systems. Due to the different spatial, spectral and radiometric resolution of these systems, as well as to the variability of natural conditions between sometimes even close dates of images, variability of the index values determined is inevitable. This is particularly true for comparisons of individual observations, but as shown (Turlej, 2009), the differences between the results averaged over certain time periods are insignificant (approximately 0.1 NDVI). This gives rise to the use, if necessary, of different systems (after appropriate transformation of their resolution parameters).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>⊠</sup>adam.bielecki@edu.uni.lodz.pl, <sup>⊠</sup>krzysztof.bedkowski@geo.uni.lodz.pl

The share of green areas can be one of the important indicators (environmental dimensions) used, in addition to social and economic dimensions, in analytical analyses of the sustainable development of a city (Szarek-Iwaniuk, 2021).

# MATERIALS

# Land use and land cover databases used in Poland

The most important repositories presenting geospatial data in Poland are: Land and Property Register (EGiB), Topographic Object Database (BDOT), General Geographic Object Database (BDOO) and thematic maps created by local geodesy centres, e.g. greenery map according to the Lodz Centre of Geodesy – ŁOG (Table 4). Databases are a public resource, representing the type of land use in terms of functions. Unfortunately, these databases are not consistent. Data from individual sources use different classification systems and are inconsistent in spatial terms (e.g. recreational areas in the LPR base, forest or bush areas in the TOD base or a park in the LCG urban greenery map that cover the same fragment of terrain but differ in terms of individual boundaries – Fig. 1).

The study used data from the Lodz Centre of Geodesy (LCG), as well as the LPR database, satellite images and demographic data from the voter registry.

# Data of the Lodz Centre of Geodesy (LCG)

As part of its tasks, the Lodz Centre of Geodesy creates cartographic studies showing green areas within the administrative boundaries of the city of Lodz.

The geodetic data are the basis for statistics on the size of green areas reported in the state statistics, i.e. in the yearbooks of the Statistics Poland and in the Local Data Base (Fig. 2).



2 500

ò





7 500 m

5 000



**Fig. 2.** Greenery in Lodz in 2005–2020 according to the Statistics Poland (Local Data Bank) Source: own preparation based on CSO data.

# Land and Property Register (LPR)

The LPR database primarily contains information on properties collected using terrain or photogrammetric surveying (Borsa et al., 2017). It is used in the performance of tasks in the field of economic planning, spatial planning, tax and benefit assessment, marking properties in land and mortgage registers, public statistics, and property management. The LPR data are used, among others, by tax authorities, as well as local government units (municipalities) for the purpose of spatial inventory of the area they cover (Notice, 2019). The LPR includes information on the location, boundaries, surface area and types of land use (Table 1).

Table 1. Types of land use according to LPR, their area and share in the city of Lodz

71 0	7	
Type of use according to LPR	Surface area [km <sup>2</sup> ]	% of the city
1	2	3
Residential areas	46.17	16.00
Industrial areas	13.02	4.51
Other built-up areas	24.36	8.44
Urbanised undeveloped areas or under development	10.24	3.55
Built-up agricultural land	6.34	2.20
Recreational areas	10.95	3.79
Roads	30.84	10.69
Ecological use	0.91	0.31
Mining land use	1.07	0.37
Forests	24.69	8.55
Wooded and bushed land	3.77	1.31
Wooded and bushed land on agricultural land	0.11	0.04
Wasteland	1.23	0.43

cont. Table 1

1	2	3
Pastures	6.66	2.31
Arable land	92.60	32.08
Orchards	2.57	0.89
Other communication areas	2.78	0.96
Railway areas	7.11	2.46
Land reserved for the construction of public roads or@railway lines	1.08	0.37
Miscellaneous land	0.34	0.12
Land under ditches	0.27	0.09
Land under surface water flowing	1.21	0.42
Land under surface water still	0.14	0.05
Land under ponds	0.19	0.06

Source: Lodz Centre of Geodesy (2018).

#### **Population data**

The population data necessary to carry out this study comes from the electoral register of voters of 30 June 2016 (UMŁ).

The distribution of the population was calculated as follows:

- 1. On the basis of vector layers of the Land and Property Register and information about the area of building outlines and the number of floors, the total area of all floors of each residential building in the city was determined.
- 2. The number of inhabitants in each of the 36 administrative auxiliary units of the city of Lodz was determined. Necessary data came from the Lodz Centre of Geodesy (vector data containing the boundaries of auxiliary units) and from the register of voters the Lodz City Hall (number of inhabitants per individual housing estate).
- 3. The size of the housing space per capita in individual administrative auxiliary units was calculated. The obtained values ranged from 35.06 m<sup>2</sup> to  $115.57 \text{ m}^2 \text{ per capita}^1$ .

4. On the basis of the index value set out in point 1 and point 3, the approximate number of inhabitants of each residential building was determined.

The allocation of the number of inhabitants to the primary fields was made taking into account the relevant shares of buildings contained therein. Based on the above calculations, the map shows the distribution of population in Lodz (Fig. 3), and as a consequence, the spatial ratio of population distribution to areas designated as greenery on the basis of satellite images is also presented.

#### Satellite data

We use the Landsat 8 satellite scene from 3 July 2015 (path 189, row 024), obtained from the US Geological Survey (EarthExplorer). At the time the study was being carried out, it was the latest available image from the full vegetation season, on which the area of Lodz was not covered by a layer of clouds. Spectral bands 4 (Red) and 5 (NIR) were used to calculate the NDVI (Rouse et al., 1973), showing both the quantity and quality of greenery (Forster, 1982) in a given location, according to a classic formula:

$$NDVI = \frac{NIR - Red}{NIR + Red}$$

Since the image of the city of Lodz was entirely within the scope of the scene and no comparisons with other cities were planned, no sun and atmospheric correction of the images was made. The data down-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For comparison, in 2002, the average floor area of an apartment in Lodz was  $60.7 \text{ m}^2$  ( $20.5 \text{ m}^2$  floor area per capita). One flat was inhabited by 2.95 people and one chamber by 0.84 people (Parysek, 2004). In the years 2011–2016, according to the Central Statistical Office (Yearbook, 2015), the average floor area of a flat in Lodz was  $53-54 \text{ m}^2$ , with  $27-28 \text{ m}^2$  per person. When comparing the indicators, one should remember about changes in the number of inhabitants of the city (725,055 in 2011 and 696,503 in 2016).



**Fig. 3.** Population distribution in Lodz *Source*: own preparation based on the electoral register of voters (2016).

loaded using the Earth Explorer USGS browser has a topographic correction (USGS, 2020). The calculated NDVI values were between -0.18 and 0.63 (Fig. 4).

In an area covered by a single pixel, there are usually many different forms of land cover/ development, not just greenery (Wirth et al., 1982; Kressler et al., 2000). In this case, the recorded NDVI value is the weighted average of the index value of all objects in the pixel area, with the weight being the share of the area of these objects in the pixel area (Figures 5–6):

$$NDVI = \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_i NDVI_i$$
$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} a_i = 1$$

where:

- $a_i$  the share of the i-th object in the pixel area,  $NDVI_i$  – NDVI value of the i-th object located in the pixel,
- *n* number of forms of land cover/use.



**Fig. 4.** NDVI for the area of the city of Lodz in the raster  $30 \times 30$  m *Source*: own preparation based on Landsat 8 image.



**Fig. 5.** Method of establishing NDVI values for areas composed of objects with different NDVI values. If the share of built-up areas and green areas are equal (50% each), the NDVI for the whole area is 0.35 *Source*: own preparation.



Fig. 6. Forms of land cover and registered NDVI values in pixels 30 × 30 m: a) objects according to LPR database, b) fragment of RGB composition of orthophotomap and grids of Landsat 8 image (30 × 30 m), c) calculated NDVI values
 Source: own preparation based on EGiB, orthophotomap and Landsat 8 image.

#### METHODS

# NDVI of selected functional areas of the city

Areas classified as green areas we focused on, include forests, parks, squares, lawns and cemeteries (Fig. 7, Table 2). The share of these green areas in the total city area is 10.50% (30.77 km<sup>2</sup>). They are largely covered with vegetation, but not fully, which is reflected in their average NDVI values (Fig. 8).

#### Table 2. The green areas in Lodz

Name	Area [km <sup>2</sup> ]	Share in the city area [%]
Forests	20.19	6.89
Parks	7.41	2.53
Lawns	0.94	0.32
Cemeteries	2.05	0.70
Squares	0.18	0.06
Total greenery	30.77	10.50

Source: own preparation based on LCG data.

Apart from the official greenery, there are many other areas with well-developed vegetation in the city, which successfully perform many important functions. For the precise characterisation of greenery resources, it is therefore necessary to also take into account the vegetation associated with undeveloped areas, i.e. areas called open according to Cieślak (2006) and residential and industrial development, traffic routes, watercourses, post-industrial wastelands, mines, etc. For a full balance, greenery associated with agricultural land (orchards, meadows, arable land) cannot be omitted, as the crops grown also fulfil many positive environmental functions (Lutz & Felici, 2008). According to Trzaskowska (2011) in analyzes of urban greenery, spontaneous, natural and synanthropic vegetation are rarely taken into account. It is most often not accepted by the society due to low aesthetic values and deteriorating sense of security. Nevertheless, it plays an important role, as it complements the spatial continuity of the urban greenery system and for this reason it should be used in the development of urban development strategies



**Fig. 7.** Green areas in Lodz *Source:* own preparation based on LCG data.



**Fig. 8.** Average NDVI values of selected functional areas of the city of Lodz *Source*: own preparation based on LCG data.

in accordance with the principles of sustainable development.

The presence of greenery is expressed in the NDVI value calculated for each pixel of the satellite image. The distribution of NDVI values (Figures 9-11) is a good characteristic of the variability of vegetation in individual parts of the city. On the basis of NDVI distributions, typical ranges of values for this index were established for areas considered as greenery. These limits have been determined by establishing the modal value for the area under analysis and then including in the range the successive ranges the values adjacent to the modal value until the required percentage of the area is reached. Since such a procedure does not achieve a value exactly equal to the assumed value (68% of pixels in this case), its completion was decided when the next range was included and the number closest to 68% was reached (with the lowest possible undervalue or excess). The adopted method of determining the range for NDVI is similar to that of the mean value and standard deviation, which is, however, more appropriate for variables with distributions close to normal distribution (Wasilewska, 2009).

The established NDVI ranges have been used to designate areas of the city which, although not officially classified as green areas, have the same values of this index. In other words, areas with a level of greenery development similar to known forms: forests, parks, lawns, squares and cemeteries were indicated, so one can expect that in a given location there are similar developed vegetation complexes (Table 3, Figures 12–13).

#### Green areas and population distribution

In order to assess the living conditions and quality of life of the city's residents, it is important for the city's green spaces to be located in the areas they live in. For the analysis of spatially variable factors of the urban environment, it is recommended to use a network of basic fields, with a hexagonal grid being the best. However, there are no clear guidelines as to their size (Szarek-Iwaniuk, 2020). We have adopted  $90 \times 90$  m grid, corresponding to groups of 9 (3 × 3) pixels of Landsat 8 satellite image as residential areas. The rationale for choosing this size of the primary field was the desire to take into account the condition of vegetation in the place of residence and its immediate surroundings. It was assumed that the immediate surrounding means a space contained within a circle with a 50 m radius, whose area is approximately equivalent to a square of  $90 \times 90$  m. Consequently, the NDVI values determined had to be converted, by averaging, from a grid of pixels to a grid of  $90 \times 90$  m primary units (Fig. 9). This operation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>⊠</sup>adam.bielecki@edu.uni.lodz.pl, <sup>⊠</sup>krzysztof.bedkowski@geo.uni.lodz.pl



**Fig. 9.** Conversion of NDVI from a  $30 \times 30$  m pixel grid of the Landsat 8 image into a  $90 \times 90$  m grid of primary fields *Source*: own preparation based on Landsat 8 image.



Fig. 10. Population distribution in the grid of 90 m × 90 m primary fields. *Source*: own preparation based on the electoral register of voters (2016) *Source*: own preparation.

only slightly changed the range of the index to values from -0.11 to 0.60.

For the purpose of the planned analyses, the number of people living was determined for each of the primary fields of a square grid of  $90 \times 90$  m, corresponding, as was the case with the NDVI value, to the size and range of 9 pixels of the satellite image.

The grid schematically divides the city space, including individual housing estates and individual buildings, into smaller sections. The way of calculating the approximate number of inhabitants in the individual primary fields was presented in the chapter Population data.

Tabular lists were prepared (Table 3).

# RESULTS

The distribution of NDVI values for many functional areas of the city clearly shows that in some areas the share of greenery in the coverage of these areas is large. The NDVI even reaches values typical of forests and parks in many places (such as wastelands).

The average value of NDVI for the whole Lodz is 0.33 and takes values from -0.18 (surface waters) to 0.63 (forests). The distribution of NDVI values within the city limits is close to the normal distribution with a predominance of areas with a low NDVI (Fig. 11a).

When comparing the NDVI distribution of individual forms of land use, it can be seen that in most cases there is no specific level of greenery for particular areas (Fig. 12).

However, there are land use types that are in practice limited to a narrow spectrum of NDVI values, such as forests. The grid size of  $90 \times 90$  m, as well as the high fragmentation of land use, means that in many cases the NDVI value represents more than one form of land cover (utility function). The analysis shows that as much as 32% of land use in LPR has an area equal to or less than 900 m<sup>2</sup>, i.e. less than one image pixel. However, it should not be forgotten that the functions of greenery are not limited to the area it occupies, but also very important for adjacent areas.

An analysis of the distribution of NDVI values for urban-specific land use forms (residential, industrial and wasteland), not associated with greenery, was also carried out. The selected areas vary considerably in terms of the distribution of NDVI values. Residential areas show a distribution close to normal, with the median established for NDVI=0.3 (Fig. 13a). The graph for industrial areas (Fig. 11b) with a high prevalence



Fig. 11. NDVI distributions in the range △NDVI = 0.01 for: a) the whole city, b) areas officially classified as green areas (forests, parks, lawns, squares, cemeteries), c) other areas not including green areas
Source: own preparation based on Landsat data.



 $^{\boxtimes}$ adam.bielecki@edu.uni.lodz.pl,  $^{\boxtimes}$ krzysztof.bedkowski@geo.uni.lodz.pl



Fig. 12. NDVI distributions in ranges of △NDVI = 0.01 for areas officially recognised as green areas in Lodz: a) forests, b) parks, c) lawns, d) squares, e) cemeteries. Red is for the range of typical (68%) NDVI values
Source: own preparation based on Landsat data.



Fig. 13. NDVI distributions within ∆NDVI = 0.05 for areas of Lodz not classified as green areas: a) residential areas, b) industrial areas, c) wastelands
Source: own preparation based on Landsat data.

of low values and a median = 0.05 clearly shows that greenery is very rare in these areas. The situation in wastelands, where the distribution of NDVI values (Fig. 11c) resembles the distribution for green areas, is the opposite. This is because, after some time, vegetation enters such areas through spontaneous succession (Rostański, 2000).

Based on the determined characteristic NDVI values for individual types of green areas in Lodz, maps were drawn of areas within the borders of Lodz, where the density and quality of vegetation is similar to the specific forms of land use (Figures 14–15), i.e. the NDVI value is within the above mentioned ranges.

The data thus collected were compared with information on the number of inhabitants living in specific characteristic areas (Table 3).

Typical NI for particu are	Typical NDVI range for particular green areas City area where NDVI is comparable to typical NDVI range		Number of inhabitants		
Object	NDVI range	[km <sup>2</sup> ]	[%]	[thousands]	[%]
Forests	0.45-0.55	56.11	19.16	3.72	0.57
Parks	0.37-0.52	110.73	37.81	26.99	4.14
Lawns	0.37-0.55	118.78	40.56	27.04	4.14
Cemeteries	0.14-0.39	169.47	57.87	502.85	77.06
Squares	0.33-0.48	137.43	46.93	94.68	14.51
Total greenery	0.42-0.55	77.78	26.56	7.46	1.14

Table 3. Share in the city's area of areas where the NDVI value corresponds to ranges typical for green areas

Source: own preparation based on Landsat data.



Fig. 14. Areas with an NDVI value within the limits typical for areas officially recognised as greenery in Lodz (0.42<NDVI≤0.55)</li>
 Source: own preparation based on own research.



 $^{\boxtimes}adam.bielecki@edu.uni.lodz.pl, ^{\boxtimes}krzysztof.bedkowski@geo.uni.lodz.pl$ 



Fig. 15. Location in the Lodz city of (on the left): a) forests, b) parks, c) lawns, d) green squares, e) cemeteries and (on the right) areas where the NDVI value corresponds to their typical ranges (compare with Fig. 10 and Table 3) Source: own preparation based on Landsat data.

# CONCLUSIONS

The presented overview maps (Figures 14–15) very visibly illustrate the fact that there are many areas in Lodz with vegetation at a level not inferior to that in areas officially classified as green areas. The area within the administrative boundaries of Lodz characterised by a similar level of vegetation development as in the areas included in public reports is over 2.5 times larger (30.77  $\text{km}^2$  to 77.78  $\text{km}^2$ ). This demonstrates that more than 1/4 of the city area (26.56%) does not differ in terms of greenery from the areas officially classified as green. However, it should be noted that the range of NDVI values (0.42-0.55), on the basis of which green areas were determined, was underestimated by the index value for cemeteries (0.14-0.39) and also by squares (0.33-0.48). These areas, due to the fact that they are equipped with various elements of impervious surface, have less greenery, as it mixes with surfaces covered with concrete and asphalt with very low NDVI values (Siciński, 1986). It should be noted that cemetery is defined as a green area in the Act on Nature Conservation, but in the Polish Classification of Buildings it is included in the category of buildings (intended for worship and religious activities), similarly in the Construction Law Act (Długozima, 2020).

On the opposite side, there are urban forests, which are obviously less intensively developed than the other areas of urban greenery (Łonkiewicz, 1997). In the case of Lodz, the limit NDVI values that characterise these areas to the greatest extent, are set at 0.45–0.55. Despite quite characteristic physiognomy, similar NDVI values were detected in an area of over 56 km<sup>2</sup>, which is almost three times the area of the forests themselves (Fig. 15a).

In general, the results show that there are much more green spaces, comparable in terms of vegetation abundance with the official green spaces. That means the city is underestimated when talking about the greenery.

Another issue is the presence of these areas in the place where the inhabitants of Lodz live and their immediate surroundings. Despite the fact that almost 1/5 of the area of Lodz has greenery comparable to that of the forest, only one inhabitant in 200 has direct access to it without having to leave their place of residence. In the case of the NDVI zone corresponding to parks and lawns, only 4% of the inhabitants (or 27 thousand in absolute numbers) have similar quality greenery in their place of residence. In the case of cemeteries, the situation is the opposite, as the majority of inhabitants (77%) have similar greenery in their place of residence. This shows that most cemeteries do not have the same environmental functions as forests, parks or lawns (Długozima, 2014).

It is also noteworthy that, despite the often very uneven distribution, the range determined by taking a next value of NDVI in increments of 0.05 starting from the modal values ranged between 67.32% and 68.44% of the analysed areas, while for normal distribution it is 68.3%. The above results therefore indicate that the method used to determine the characteristic values, as regards the NDVI for individual forms of land use, is correct.

It is also worth considering the possibility of linking the NDVI or other vegetation indices with features that describe other qualities of the vegetation, such as its height and volume. Proposals in this area were presented by Worm and others (2019), based on the example of the city of Lodz.

In addition to these research, it might be a good idea to take into consideration an open access spatial datasets, e.g. OpenStreetMap where users who know a specific area classify the space based on its physiognomy.

A similar approach to the assessment of the greenness of the city was adopted by Gupta et al. (2012). They made an attempt to take into account, in addition to vegetation, also the characteristics of buildings (density and height), which were to indirectly indicate the density of the population. The data they used for this purpose came from the interpretation / processing of remote sensing data, while we used information from official databases. Additionally, what distinguishes our approach is the reference of NDVI intervals to easy-to-imagine objects and related forms of covering (and filling) the space

with greenery (parks, trees, lawns, squares, cemeteries), while the above-mentioned authors adopted the artificial boundaries of the intervals values for NDVI and other products. What is common, however, is the endeavor to identify, finally, areas requiring, as a priority, greater development of green areas.

work	
Translated name	Original name in Polish
TOD, Topographic Objects	BDOT10k, Baza Danych
DataBase	Obiektów Topograficznych
GGOD, General Geographic Objects DataBase	BDOO, Baza Danych Obiektów Ogólnogeograficznych
LPR, Land and Property	EGiB, Ewidencja Gruntów
Register	i Budynków
LCG, Lodz Centre of	ŁOG, Łódzki Ośrodek
Geodesy	Geodezji

**Table 4.** Translated and original names and their abbreviations concerning institutions and databases used in this

Source: own preparation.

**Author contributions:** authors have given approval to the final version of the article. Authors contributed to this work as follows: A.B. and K.B. developed the concept and designed the study, A.B. collected the data, A.B. and K.B. analysed and interpreted the data, A.B. prepared draft of article, K.B. revised the article critically for important intellectual content.

**Funding:** This research was not undertaken as part of the any project and was not funded by any grant.

## REFERENCES

- Badgley, G., Field, C.B., & Berry, J.A. (2017). Canopy nearinfrared reflectance and terrestrial photosynthesis, *Science Advances*, 3, 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1126/ sciadv.1602244.
- Będkowski, K., & Bielecki, A. (2017). Ocena dostępności zieleni w miejscu zamieszkania w miastach z wykorzystaniem NDVI oraz krzywej koncentracji Lorenza [Assessment of the availability of greenery in the place of residence in cities using NDVI and the Lorenz's concentration curve]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 57, 5–14.

- Białobok, S. (1976). Ochrona zadrzewień i roślin w najbliższym otoczeniu człowieka [Protection of trees and plants in the immediate vicinity of humans]. In W. Michajłow et al. (Eds.), *Ochrona przyrodniczego* środowiska człowieka (pp. 223–245). Warszawa: PWN.
- Borsa, M., Zagajewski, B., & Kulawik, B. (2017). *Teledetekcja w planowaniu przestrzennym* [*Remote sensing in spatial planning*]. Warszawa: Ministerstwo Infrastruktury i Budownictwa.

Cieślak, I. (2006). Identyfikacja układu terenów otwartych w mieście Olsztynie [Identification of an arrangement of open spaces in the city of Olsztyn]. *Acta Sci. Pol. Administratio Locorum*, 5(1–2), 17–24.

- Colombo, R., Bellingeri, D., Pasolini, D., & Marino, C.M. (2003). Retrieval of leaf area index in different vegetation types using high resolution satellite data. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 86, 120–131. https:// doi.org/10.1016/S0034-4257(03)00094-4.
- Cudny, W. (2011). Model przemian miasta postsocjalistycznego – przykład Łodzi [Model of changes in a post-socialist city – the example of Łódź]. *Studia Miejskie*, 4, 153–159.
- DeFries, R.S., Rudel, T., Uriarte, M., & Hansen, M. (2010). Deforestation driven by urban population growth and agricultural trade in the twenty-first century. *Nature Geoscience*, *3*(3), 178–181. https://doi.org/10.1038/ ngeo756.
- Deering, D.W. (1978). *Rangeland reflectance characteristics measured by aircraft and spacecraft sensors* (Ph.D. Dissertation). Texas A&M University, College Stadion.
- Długozima, A., & Rej, M. (2014). Współczesne tendencje w projektowaniu cmentarzy w Europie [Contemporary trends in designing cemeteries in Europe]. Przestrzeń i Forma, 21, 403–416. https://doi.org/10.3390/ su13169303.
- Długozima, A. (2020). Social infastructure of burial nature in Poland by voivodeships – conditions and changes. *Acta Sci. Pol. Administratio Locorum*, *19*(1), 19–31. https://doi.org/10.31648/aspal.4382.
- Forster, B. (1982). Some Urban Measurements from Landsat Data. *Photogrammetric Engineering & Remote Sensing*, Maryland, 49(12), 1693–1707.
- Gupta, K., Kumar, P., Pathan, S.K., & Sharma, K.P. (2012). Urban Neighborhood Green Index – A measure of green spaces in urban areas. *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 105(3), 325–335. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. landurbplan.2012.01.003.
- Haber, Z., & Urbański, P. (2005). Kształtowanie terenów zieleni z elementami ekologii [Shaping green areas

*with elements of ecology*]. Poznań: Wyd. Akademii Rolniczej im. Augusta Cieszkowskiego w Poznaniu.

- Jackson, R.D., & Huete, A.R. (1991). Interpreting vegetation indices. *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*, 11, 185–200. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-5877(05) 80004-2.
- Jarocińska, A. (2011). Modelowanie charakterystyk spektralnych heterogenicznych zbiorowisk trawiastych przy użyciu modelu transferu promieniowania [Simulating spectrum for heterogenous meadows using Radiative Transfer Model]. *Teledetekcja* Środowiska, 46, 29–42.
- Jarocińska, A., & Zagajewski, B. (2008). Korelacje naziemnych i lotniczych teledetekcyjnych wskaźników roślinności dla zlewni Bystrzanki [Correlations of ground- and airborne-level acquired vegetation indices of the Bystrzanka catchment]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 40, 100–124.
- Konijnendijk, C.C. (2003). A decade of urban forestry in Europe. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 5(2), 173–186. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1389-9341(03)00023-6.
- Kopańczyk, K., & Fitrzyk, M. (2016). Satellite imagery for the improvement of SOZO database – the case study in Central and High Sudetes. *Acta Scientiarum Polonorum. Geodesia et Descriptio Terrarum*, *15*(1–4), 5–18.
- Kosiński, K., & Hoffmann-Niedek, A. (2008). Klasyfikacja obiektowa użytków zielonych z wykorzystaniem wieloletnich zmian NDVI i filtracji kierunkowych obrazu satelitarnego [Object grassland classification using multi-year NDVI changes and directional filtering of satellite image]. Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 18, 273–282.
- Kosiński, K., Hoffmann-Niedek, A., & Kozłowska, T. (2012). Rozpoznawanie ekologicznych użytków zielonych na zdjęciach Landsat ETM+ [Ecological grasslands recognition on Landsat ETM+ images]. Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 24, 155–163.
- Kosiński, K., & Kozłowska, T. (2003). Zastosowanie wskaźnika NDVI i filtracji kierunkowej do rozpoznawania użytków zielonych oraz analizy zmian siedlisk i zbiorowisk łąkowych [Application of NDVI index and directional filtration in grassland recognition and changes of grassland habitats and communities analyzing]. Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 13B, 387–395.
- Kressler, F., Mucher, C.A., Steinnocher, K., & Thunnissen, H.A.M. (2000). Evaluation of medium-resolution

satellite images for land use monitoring using spectral mixture analysis. *International Archives of Photogrammetry and Remote Sensing*, XXXIII, Part B7, Amsterdam, 709–716.

- Krukowski, M. (2018). Modelowanie kartograficzne w ocenie jakości życia w mieście – aspekt zieleni miejskiej w Lublinie [Cartographic modeling in assessing the quality of life in the city – aspect of urban greenery in Lublin]. Annales Universitatis Mariae Curie-Sklodowska, sectio B-Geographia, Geologia, Mineralogia et Petrographia, 73, 7–27. http:// dx.doi.org/10.17951/b.2018.73.0.7-27.
- Krukowski, M., Cebrykow, P., & Płusa, J. (2016). Klasyfikacja terenów zieleni w Lublinie na podstawie zdjęcia satelitarnego IKONOS 2 [Classification of green areas in Lublin based on satellite imagery IKONOS 2]. Barometr Regionalny. Analizy i prognozy, 2, 35–44.
- Kubalska, J., & Preuss, R. (2014). Wykorzystanie danych fotogrametrycznych do inwentaryzacji zieleni na terenach zurbanizowanych [Use of the photogrammetric data for vegetation inventory on urban areas]. *Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 26*, https://doi.org/10.14681/afkit.2014.006.
- Lhermitte, S., Verbesselt, J., Verstraeten, W.W., & Coppin, P. (2010). A pixel based regeneration index using time series similarity and spatial context. *Photogrammetric Engineering and Remote Sensing*, 76(6), 673–682. https://doi.org/10.14358/PERS.76.6.673.
- Lutz, M., & Felici, F. (2008). Indicators to identify the agricultural pressures on environmental functions and their use in the development of agri-environmental measures. *Regional Environmental Change*, *9*(3), 181–196. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10113-008-0061-9.
- Lüdecke, M.K.B., Ramge, P.H., & Kohlmaier, G.H. (1996). The use of satellite NDVI data for the validation of global vegetation phenology models: Application to the Frankfurt Biosphere model. *Ecological Modelling*, 91, 255–270. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3800(95)00192-1.
- Łonkiewicz, B. (1997). Urządzanie i zagospodarowanie lasu w terenach zurbanizowanych i uzdrowiskowych [Organization and management of the forest in urban and spa areas]. *Postępy Techniki w Leśnictwie*, 64, 31–37.
- Łukasiewicz, A., & Łukasiewicz, S. (2016). Rola i kształtowanie zieleni miejskiej [The role and shaping of urban greenery]. Poznań: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM.
- Michałowska, K., & Hejmanowska, B. (2008). Możliwości wykorzystania wieloczasowych obrazów znormali-

zowanego indeksu wegetacji (NDVI) i archiwalnych ortofotomap do badania zmienności wybranych elementów środowiska [A possibility of using temporal images normalised difference vegetation index (NDVI) for detection of environmental changes]. *Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 18*, 397–407.

- Musiał, J. (2009). Metodyka oceny stanu środowiska przyrodniczego obszarów prawnie chronionych w Polsce w oparciu o zintegrowane dane teledetekcyjne i klimatyczne [The methodology of assessment of the environmental conditions in protected areas in Poland based on integrated remote sensing and climatic data]. Archiwum Fotogrametrii, Kartografii i Teledetekcji, 20, 307–320.
- Niedzielko, J., Szepietowska, M., Boral, B., Milczarek, M., Pokrzywnicka, M., Łach, G., Kaźmierczak, M., & Jarocińska, A. (2012). Analiza zależności między zawartością wody w roślinach zmierzoną w terenie a teledetekcyjnymi wskaźnikami roślinności [Analysis of the relationships between vegetation water content obtained from field measurements and vegetation indices]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 47, 43–57.
- Nouri, H., Beecham, S., Anderson, S., & Nagler, P. (2014). High spatial resolution WorldView-2 imagery for mapping NDVI and its relationship to temporal urban landscape evapotranspiration factors. *Remote Sensing*, 6, 580–602. https://doi.org/10.3390/rs6010580.
- Obwieszczenie Ministra Inwestycji i Rozwoju z dnia 3 stycznia 2019 r. w sprawie ogłoszenia jednolitego tekstu rozporządzenia Ministra Rozwoju Regionalnego i Budownictwa w sprawie ewidencji gruntów i budynków [Notice of the Minister for Investment and Development of 3 January 2019 on the publication of the single text of the Regulation of the Minister of Regional Development and Construction on land and building records], Journal of Laws of 2019 item 393.
- Panda, S.S., Ames, D.P., & Panigrahi, S. (2010). Application of Vegetation Indices for Agricultural Crop Yield Prediction Using Neural Network Techniques. *Remote Sensing*, 2, 673–696. https://doi.org/10.3390/ rs2030673.
- Parysek, J.J. (2004), Warunki życia w miastach polskich w okresie transformacji [Living conditions in Polish cities during the transition]. In I. Jażdżewska (Ed.). XVII Konwersatorium Wiedzy o Mieście "Zróżnicowanie warunków życia ludności w mieście" (pp. 55–66). Łódź: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Łódzkiego.

- Pluto-Kossakowska, J., Władyka, M., & Tulkowska, W. (2018). Ocena obrazowych danych teledetekcyjnych do identyfikacji obiektów w zielonej i błękitnej infrastrukturze [Assessment of remote sensing image data to identify objects in green and blue infrastructure]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 59, 13–27.
- Pyra, M., & Adamczyk, J. (2018). Klasyfikacja zorientowana obiektowo w inwentaryzacji obiektów Zielonej Infrastruktury na przykładzie dzielnicy Ursynów w Warszawie [Object-oriented classification in the inventory of Green Infrastructure objects on the example of the Ursynów district in Warsaw]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 59, 29–49.

Rejestr wyborców wg stanu na dzień 30 czerwca 2016 [Register of voters as of June 30], 2016, Urząd Miasta Łodzi.

- Robinson, N.P., Allred, B.W., Jones, M.O., Moreno, A., Kimball, J.S., Naugle, D.E., Erickson, T.A., & Richardson, A.D. (2017). A Dynamic Landsat Derived Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI). Product for the Conterminous United States. *Remote Sens.*, 9, 863. https://doi.org/10.3390/ rs9080863.
- Rocznik 2015: Rocznik Statystyczny Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej 2015 [Yearbook of 2015: Statistical Yearbook of the Republic of Poland 2015], Główny Urząd Statystyczny, Warszawa.
- Rostański, A. (2000). Trawy spontanicznie zasiedlające nieużytki poprzemysłowe w aglomeracji katowickiej [Grasses spontaneously inhabiting post-industry wasteland in the Katowice agglomeration]. *Grassland Science in Poland*, *3*, 141–150.
- Rouse, J.W., Haas, R.H., Deering, D.W., & Schell, J.A. (1973). Monitoring the vernal advancement and retrogradation (green wave effect) of natural vegetation, Progress Report RSC 1978–2, Texas A & M University, USA.
- Siciński, J.T. (1986). Zieleń polskich nekropolii [Green of Polish necropolises]. *Aura*, *11*, 17–18.
- Sulma, S., Yulianto, F., Nugroho, J.T., & Sofan, P. (2016). A support vector machine object based image analysis approach on urban green space extraction using Pleiades-1A imagery. *Modeling Earth Systems* and Environment, 2(2), 2–13. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s40808-016-0108-8.
- Szarek-Iwaniuk, P. (2020). Changes and correlations in land-use structure within the administrative boundaries of a town – a case study. *Acta Sci. Pol.*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>⊠</sup>adam.bielecki@edu.uni.lodz.pl, <sup>⊠</sup>krzysztof.bedkowski@geo.uni.lodz.pl

*Administratio Locorum 19*(1), 61–69. https://doi. org/10.31648/aspal.4935.

- Szarek-Iwaniuk, P. (2021). Measurement of spatial order as an indicator of sustainable development of functional urban areas in regional capitals. *Acta Sci. Pol. Administratio Locorum*, 20(2), 139–152. https://doi. org/10.31648/aspal.6536.
- Tomaszewska, M., Lewiński, S., & Woźniak, E. (2011). Wykorzystanie zdjęć satelitarnych MODIS do badania stopnia pokrycia terenu roślinnością [Use of MODIS Satellite Images to Study the Percentage of Vegetation Cover]. *Teledetekcja Środowiska*, 46, 13–22.
- Trisakti, B. (2017). Vegetation type classification and vegetation cover percentage estimation in urban green zone using pleiades imagery. In *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 54(1), IOP Publishing: 1–7. https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/54/1/012003.
- Trzaskowska, E. (2011). Zbiorowiska synantropijne niedoceniony potencjał współczesnych miast [Synantropic communities – underappreaciated potention of contemporary cities]. Acta Sci. Pol. Administratio Locorum, 10(3), 55-66.
- Tucker, C.J. (1979). Red and photographic infrared linear combinations for monitoring vegetation. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 8, 127–150. https://doi. org/10.1016/0034-4257(79)90013-0.
- Turlej, K. (2009). Porównanie wartości NDVI odczytanych z obrazów satelitarnych NOAA AVHRR, SPOT-VEGETATION I TERRA MODIS [Comparison of NDVI index based on NOAA AVHRR, SPOT-VEGETATION and TERRA MODIS satellite data]. Teledetekcja Środowiska, 42, 83–88.
- Ustawa 2004: Ustawa z dnia 16 kwietnia 2004 r. o ochronie przyrody [Act 2004: Law of 16 April 2004 on the Protection of Nature] (c.t. Journal of Law of 20.10.2015 item 1651).
- Walker, D.A. et al. (2012). Environment, vegetation and greenness (NDVI) along the North America and Eurasia Arctic transects. *Environmental Research Letters*, 7, 015504. https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/7/1/015504.

- Wang, T., Skidmore, A.K., Toxopeus, A.G., & Lin, X. (2009). Understory bamboo discrimination using a winter image. *Photogrammetric Engineering and Remote Sensing*, 75(1), 37–47.
- Wasilewska, E. (2009). Statystyka opisowa od podstaw [Descriptive statistics from scratch]. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo SGGW.
- Wang, L., Hunt, J.E.R., Qu, J.J., Hao, X., & Daughtry, C.S.T. (2011). Towards estimation of canopy foliar biomass with spectral reflectance measurements. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 115(3), 836–840. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2010.11.011.
- Wirth, H., Schilbach, G., & Wirth, A. (1987). Beitrag zur Analyse von Fernerkundungsdaten im SUB-PIXEL-Bereich. *Vermessungstechnik*, *33*(2), 56–59. https://doi. org/10.13140/RG.2.1.3313.8162.
- Worm, A., Będkowski, K., & Bielecki, A. (2019). Wykorzystanie wskaźników powierzchniowych i objętościowych z wysokorozdzielczych danych teledetekcyjnych do oceny wypełnienia roślinnością kwartałów miejskich w centrum miasta Łodzi [The use of surface and volume indicators from high resolution remote sensing data to assess the vegetation filling of urban quarters in Łódź city centre, Poland]. *Teledetekcja* Środowiska, 60, 5–20.
- Wu, W., Wang, M., Zhu, N., Zhang, W., & Sun, H. (2019).
  Residential satisfaction about urban greenness: Heterogeneous effects across social and spatial gradients. Urban Forestry & Urban Greening, 38, 133-144. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ufug.2018.11.011.
- Yan, J., Zhou, W., Han, L., & Qian, Y. (2018). Mapping vegetation functional types in urban areas with WorldView-2 imagery: Integrating object-based classification with phenology. Urban Forestry & Urban Greening, 31, 230-240. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. ufug.2018.01.021.
- Zarzecki, M., & Pasierbiński, A. (2009). Zastosowanie GIS i teledetekcji w badaniach szaty roślinnej [Use of GIS and remote sensing in vegetation cover studies]. *Wiadomości Botaniczne*, 53(3/4), 53–66.

www.gugik.gov.pl

www.sdg.data.gov

www.stat.gov.pl

www.usgs.gov/land-resources/nli/landsat/landsat-levelsprocessing